

December 19, 2016

Franco Noravian
409 West Broadway
Glendale, CA 91204

**RE: 411 SOUTH VERDUGO ROAD
ADMINISTRATIVE DESIGN REVIEW CASE NO. PDR 1623143**

Dear Mr. Noravian:

On December 19, 2016, the Director of Community Development, pursuant to the provisions of the Glendale Municipal Code, Title 30, Chapter 30.47, **APPROVED** your design review application to construct a new two-unit, 4,155 square-foot, two-story, multi-family residential building with attached garages on a 7,440 square-foot lot in the "R-3050" – Moderate Density Residential Zone located at **411 South Verdugo Road**. The proposal includes demolition of the existing fire-damaged single-family dwelling, originally constructed in 1931.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. That the plans be revised to identify the downspouts and gutters for staff review and approval.
2. That the landscape plan (specifically the plan for the front yard) be redesigned to better complement the traditional style of the development and to comply with the landscaping standards.
3. That an exterior lighting proposal be submitted for staff review and approval for the exterior lighting for the first and second floor with fixtures that are consistent with the proposed traditional style of the development.
4. That details for the fences and gates be submitted for staff review and approval. The design and material should be appropriate to the traditional style of the building.
5. That the material for the driveways and walkways be identified on the plans; the material(s) shall be decorative.
6. That the new windows be appropriately recessed into the openings with wood sills and frames. Revised section details shall be submitted for staff review and approval.

SUMMARY OF THE DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT'S DECISION

Site Planning – The proposed site planning is appropriate to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The new two-unit multi-family building will face South Verdugo Road, where there is no predominant street setback pattern. The project features a 25'-0" street-front setback, consistent with the Zoning Code requirement. The existing, mature, 34-inch Oak tree (street tree) in the public right-of way will be maintained and further help screen the project from the street.
- The two new units are attached via the garages in between the front unit and the rear units, while the majority of the building footprint is located on the northerly half of the lot.

The proposed 39.1% lot coverage is below the maximum 50% limit for the R-3050 zone and the project complies with all interior setback standards.

- The grade-level garages are accessed from South Verdugo Road via a 10'-0" wide driveway located to the south of the property. The garages are appropriately screened from the street, as they are located behind the front unit and incorporated into the overall design of the development. The driveway material is not identified on the plans. A condition of approval is recommended that requires the driveway design and material to be submitted for staff review and approval.
- The project provides the required, functional common and private outdoor spaces; each unit has an attached private open space area and there is a substantial, 400 square-foot, landscaped common open space area tucked between the front unit and the first garage.
- The proposed landscaping plan features new drought tolerant landscaping around the perimeter of the lot and complies with the 30% minimum landscaping requirement. However, the landscape plan indicates that the front yard area will be entirely wood mulch, which does not complement the selected style, nor does it comply with the landscaping standards. A condition of approval is recommended that this area be redesigned to include live plant material that is consistent with Zoning Code requirements.
- There are two new fences located along the northerly property line with a maximum height of 6'-0". In addition, the plans identify gates leading to the private outdoor area for each unit. These fences are appropriately located on the site, however there isn't enough information provided about the details. A condition of approval is recommended that the applicant submit details for the fences and gates for staff review and approval. The design and material should be appropriate to the traditional style of the building.
- The mechanical equipment and trash storage for each unit is appropriately located and screened from view for both units.
- The gutters, downspouts, and light fixtures are not identified on the drawings. Conditions of approval have been recommended requiring revised drawings to be provided for staff review and approval.

Mass and Scale – The proposed massing and scale are appropriate to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The proposed two-story project is located in a moderate density residential zone along a major arterial, South Verdugo Road, with predominantly one- and two-story multi-family development surrounding the subject property. The two properties directly abutting the project site feature one-story residential structures. Further north and south of the project site are existing, low-scale commercial developments (primarily neighborhood-serving retail and service uses). The proposed two-story project fits within the surrounding context.
- The massing of the new construction is appropriately broken up along the interior property lines by stepping the second floor back from the first. Portions of the second-story cantilever over the first floor, primarily over the parking garages, which further breaks up the massing.
- The front unit will be one-story and 1,241 square feet in size with two bedrooms. The second unit is two stories and 1,884 square feet in size with three bedrooms. The apparent size and scale of the larger, rear unit is minimized by locating it to the rear of the development, and maintaining a one-story unit at the front, facing the street.
- The project features hipped and gable roof forms, appropriately incorporated into the traditional style of the development with a 4:12 roof pitch throughout the development.

The overall height of the development will be 23'-6" and two stories, which complies with the height standard and is consistent with the surrounding properties.

Building Design and Detailing – The proposed design and detailing are appropriate to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- Overall, the consistent use of materials and colors throughout the project helps to reinforce the traditional design concept.
- The entryways for each unit are well integrated into the design, and avoid a sense of monumentality. Both unit entries are well defined, featuring a porch and recessed doorway with a single-door entry. The new doors will be wood with partial glazing at the top.
- All new windows will be vinyl, clear glass and are an appropriate combination of fixed glass, and casement operations. New wood shutters will accent the windows for the front and rear unit and are appropriately balanced throughout. A condition of approval is recommended requiring a section detail to be submitted that shows the new windows recessed in the wall opening with wood sills, and frames to be consistent with the traditional style.
- The paving material is not identified on the plans. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the material be identified and that they be decorative. The applicant may consider the use of permeable paving.
- The traditional style of the project features an appropriate combination of exterior cladding material including horizontal hardiplank siding, a stone veneer base, stucco, and a composition shingle roof. These finish materials are consistent with the style of the development.

This approval is for the project design only. Administrative Design Review approval of a project does not constitute compliance with the Zoning Code and/or Building Code requirements. Please refer to the end of this letter for information regarding plan check submittal. If there are any questions, please contact the case planner, Vista Ezzati, at 818-937-8180 or via email at VEzzati@glendaleca.gov.

APPEAL PERIOD (effective date), TIME LIMIT, LAPSE OF PRIVILEGES, TIME EXTENSION

The applicant's attention is called to the fact that this grant is not a permit or license and that any permits and licenses required by law must be obtained from the proper City and public agency.

Under the provisions of the Glendale Municipal Code, Title 30, Chapter 30.62, any person affected by the above decision has the right to appeal said decision to the Design Review Board if it is believed that the decision is in error or that procedural errors have occurred, or if there is substantial new evidence which could not have been reasonably presented. It is strongly advised that appeals be filed early during the appeal period and in person so that imperfections/incompleteness may be corrected before the appeal period expires. Any appeal must be filed on the prescribed forms within fifteen (15) days following the actual date of the decision. Information regarding appeals and appeal forms will be provided by the Permit Services Center (PSC) or the Community Development Department (CDD) upon request and must be filed with the prescribed fee prior to expiration of the 15-day period, on or before **JANUARY 3, 2017** at the Permit Services Center (PSC), 633 East Broadway, Room 101, Monday thru Friday 7:00 am to 12:00 pm, or at the Community Development Department (CDD), 633 East Broadway, Room 103, Monday thru Friday 12:00 pm to 5 pm.

APPEAL FORMS available on-line: www.glendaleca.gov/appeals

To save you time and a trip - please note that some of our FORMS are available on line and may be downloaded. AGENDAS and other NOTICES are also posted on our website. Visit us.

TRANSFERABILITY

This authorization runs with the land or the use for which it was intended for and approved. In the event the property is to be leased, rented or occupied by any person or corporation other than yourself, it is incumbent that you advise them regarding the conditions and/or limitations of this grant.

EXTENSION: An extension of the design review approval may be requested one time and extended for up to a maximum of one (1) additional year upon receipt of a written request from the applicant and demonstration that a reasonable effort to act on such right and privilege has commenced within the two (2) years of the approval date. In granting such extension the applicable review authority shall make a written finding that neighborhood conditions have not substantially changed since the granting of the design review approval.

NOTICE – subsequent contacts with this office


The applicant is further advised that all subsequent contact with this office regarding this determination must be with the case planner, **Vista Ezzati**, who acted on this case. This would include clarification and verification of condition compliance and plans or building permit applications, etc., and shall be accomplished **by appointment only**, in order to assure that you receive service with a minimum amount of waiting. You should advise any consultant representing you of this requirement as well.

If an appeal is not filed within the 15-day appeal period of the decision, plans may be submitted for Building and Safety Division plan check. **Prior** to Building and Safety Division plan check submittal, approved plans must be stamped approved by Planning Division staff. **Any** changes to the approved plans will require resubmittal of revised plans for approval. **Prior** to Building and Safety Division plan check submittal, **all** changes to approved plans must be on file with the Planning Division.

An appointment must be made with the case planner, Vista Ezzati, for stamp and signature prior to submitting for Building plan check. Please contact Vista Ezzati directly at 818-937-8180 or via email at VEzzati@glendaleca.gov.

Sincerely,

PHILIP LANZAFAME
Director of Community Development


Urban Design Studio Staff

JP:ve

**City of Glendale
Community Development Department
Design Review Staff Report – Multi-Family**

Meeting/Decision Date: December 16, 2016	Address: 411 South Verdugo Road
Review Authority: <input type="checkbox"/> DRB <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ADR <input type="checkbox"/> HPC <input type="checkbox"/> CC	APN: 5680-017-012
Case Number: PDR 1623143	Applicant: Franco Noravian
Prepared By: Vista Ezzati, Planning Assistant	Owner: Vahe Mangasaryan

Project Summary

The applicant is proposing to construct a new 2-unit, 4,155 square-foot (with 3,125 square-feet of habitable floor area), two-story, multi-family residential building with attached garages on a 7,440 square-foot lot located in the R-3050 zone. The proposal includes demolition of the existing fire-damaged single-family dwelling, originally constructed in 1931.

The proposed work includes:

- Demolition of the existing fire-damaged, 780 square-foot single-family residence and detached one-car garage.
- The new one-story front unit will be 1,241 square feet in size with two bedrooms and an attached 370 square-foot, two-car garage.
- The new two-story unit at the rear will be 1,884 square feet in size with three bedrooms and an attached 555 square-foot, three-car garage.
- The project includes the Code-required common open space, private open space, and landscaping.

Existing Property/Background

The subject property is an interior lot, mid-block on South Verdugo Road, just south of Colorado Street. The subject property is located in a moderate density residential zone along a major arterial with predominantly multi-family development surrounding the subject property. The site topography consists of relatively flat terrain and has a rectangular shape similar to other properties in the neighborhood. There are three trees on-site, one which is 66 inches in diameter; all onsite trees are proposed to be removed to allow for development of the project. The existing 34-inch Oak tree in the public right-of-way is to remain.

The site was originally developed in 1931 with a one-story, 780 square-foot single-family home with a detached one car garage at the rear of the property. The structures were designed in the Bungalow Craftsman style and damaged by fire in March 2016. The onsite structures will be demolished as part of this project. The City's Historic Preservation Planner has determined that the existing structures are not eligible for designation for the Local, State, or National Register of Historic Resources, and would not be considered a historic resource under the California Environmental Quality Act. A written analysis prepared by staff is attached to this report and identifies the subject property with a status code of "6Z", indicating that it is ineligible for designation under local or state criteria.

On September 2, 2016, the Planning Hearing Officer approved with conditions Administrative Exception Case No. PAE 1614125 to allow a 1'-6" reduction or 9.25 percent deviation from the required minimum garage depth, as required by Chapter 30.32.090 of the Glendale Municipal Code, in conjunction with the development of two new multi-family dwelling units on the site.

Staff Recommendation

Approve Approve with Conditions Return for Redesign Deny

Last Date Reviewed / Decision

First time submittal for final review.
 Other:

Zone: R3050 - Moderate Density Residential

Although this design review does not convey final zoning approval, the project has been reviewed for consistency with the applicable Codes and no inconsistencies have been identified.

Active/Pending Permits and Approvals

- None
- Other: On September 2, 2016, the Planning Hearing Officer approved Administrative Exception Case No. PAE 1614125 with conditions, as noted above.

CEQA Status:

- The project is exempt from CEQA review as a Class 1 "Existing Facilities" exemption pursuant to Section 15301 of the State CEQA Guidelines.
- The project is exempt from CEQA review as a Class 3 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" exemption pursuant to Section 15303 of the State CEQA Guidelines.
- Other:

Site Slope and Grading

- None proposed
- Less than 50% current average slope and less than 1500 cubic yards of earth movement (cut and/or fill); no additional review required.
- 1500 cubic yards or greater of earth movement:
- 50% or greater current average slope:

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Site Planning

Are the following items satisfactory and compatible with the project site and surrounding area?

Building Location

- yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Setbacks of buildings on site
- Prevailing setbacks on the street

Yards and Usable Open Space

- yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Outdoor space integrated into site design and acknowledges adjacent development
- Common space easily accessible from all units
- Appropriate separation/screening from residential units
- Discrete seating and amenity areas allow for multiple users

Garage Location and Driveway

- yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Garage fully integrated into overall structure
- Driveway and curb-cut widths minimized
- Grade-level garages and parking, if allowed, are appropriately screened from the street
- Decorative paving complements building design
- Stairs and lifts to subterranean garages incorporated into the design of the project

The driveway material is not identified on the plans. A condition of approval is recommended that requires the driveway design and material to be submitted for staff review and approval.

Landscape Design

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Complementary to building design
- Maintain existing trees when possible
- Provide landscaping adjacent to driveways and garages
- 20% of planting at above-grade common spaces is within 9 inches of finish floor
- Above-grade tree wells are at least 6 inches higher than box size of tree

The landscape plan indicates that the front yard area will be entirely wood mulch, which does not complement the selected style, nor does it comply with the landscape standards. A condition of approval is recommended that this area be redesigned to include live plant material.

Walls and Fences

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Appropriate style/color/material for building design
- Perimeter walls treated at both sides
- Retaining walls minimized
- Appropriately sized and located

Two new, 6-foot high fences are proposed along the northerly property line. In addition, the plans identify gates leading to the private outdoor area for each unit. A condition of approval is recommended that the applicant submit details for the fences and gates for staff review and approval. The design and material should be appropriate to the traditional style of the building.

Equipment, Trash, and Drainage

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Equipment screened and well located
- Trash storage out of public view
- All screening integrated with overall building and/or landscape design
- Downspouts appropriately located
- Vents, utility connections integrated with design, avoid primary facades

The gutters and downspouts are not shown on the drawings. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the plans be revised to identify the downspouts and gutters.

Lighting

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Light fixtures are appropriate to the building and/or landscape design
- Avoid over-lit facades; consider ambient light conditions when developing lighting scheme
- Utilize shielded fixtures to avoid light spillover onto adjacent properties

No exterior lighting is proposed, though it will likely be needed. A condition is proposed requiring submittal of a lighting proposal to include exterior lighting for the first and second floor with fixtures that are consistent with the traditional style of the development.

Determination of Compatibility: Site Planning

The proposed site planning is appropriate, as modified by any proposed conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The new two-unit multi-family building will face South Verdugo Road, where there is no predominant street setback pattern. The project features a 25'-0" street-front setback, consistent with the Zoning Code requirement. The existing, mature, 34-inch Oak tree (street tree) in the public right-of-way will be maintained and further help screen the project from the street.
- The two new units are attached via the garages in between the front unit and the rear units, while the majority of the building footprint is located on the northerly half of the lot. The proposed 39.1% lot coverage is below the maximum 50% limit for the R-3050 zone and the project complies with all interior setback standards.
- The grade-level garages are accessed from South Verdugo Road via a 10'-0" wide driveway located to the south of the property. The garages are appropriately screened from the street, as they are located behind the front unit and incorporated into the overall design of the development. The driveway material is not identified on the plans. A condition of approval is recommended that requires the driveway design and material to be submitted for staff review and approval.
- The project provides the required, functional common and private outdoor spaces; each unit has an attached private open space area and there is a substantial, 400 square-foot, landscaped common open space area tucked between the front unit and the first garage.
- The proposed landscaping plan features new drought tolerant landscaping around the perimeter of the lot and complies with the 30% minimum landscaping requirement. However, the landscape plan indicates that the front yard area will be entirely wood mulch, which does not complement the selected style, nor does it comply with the landscaping standards. A condition of approval is recommended that this area be redesigned to include live plant material that is consistent with Zoning Code requirements.
- There are two new fences located along the northerly property line with a maximum height of 6'-0". In addition, the plans identify gates leading to the private outdoor area for each unit. These fences are appropriately located on the site, however there isn't enough information provided about the details. A condition of approval is recommended that the applicant submit details for the fences and gates for staff review and approval. The design and material should be appropriate to the traditional style of the building.
- The mechanical equipment and trash storage for each unit is appropriately located and screened from view for both units.
- The gutters, downspouts, and light fixtures are not identified on the drawings. Conditions of approval have been recommended requiring revised drawings to be provided for staff review and approval.

Massing and Scale

Are the following items satisfactory and compatible with the project site and surrounding area?

Building Relates to its Surrounding Context

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Relates to predominant pattern through appropriate proportions and transitions
- Impact of larger building minimized

Building Relates to Existing Topography

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Form and profile follow topography
- Alteration of existing land form minimized
- Retaining walls terrace with slope

Consistent Architectural Concept

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Concept governs massing and height

Scale and Proportion yes n/a no*If "no" select from below and explain:*

- Scale and proportion fit context
- Articulation avoids overbearing forms
- Appropriate solid/void relationships
- Entry and major features well located
- Avoids sense of monumentality

Roof Forms yes n/a no*If "no" select from below and explain:*

- Roof reinforces design concept
- Configuration appropriate to context

Determination of Compatibility: Mass and Scale

The proposed massing and scale are appropriate, as modified by any proposed conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The proposed two-story project is located in a moderate density residential zone along a major arterial, South Verdugo Road, with predominantly one- and two-story multi-family development surrounding the subject property. The two properties directly abutting the project site feature one-story residential structures. Further north and south of the project site are existing, low-scale commercial developments (primarily neighborhood-serving retail and service uses). The proposed two-story project fits within the surrounding context.
- The massing of the new construction is appropriately broken up along the interior property lines by stepping the second floor back from the first. Portions of the second-story cantilever over the first floor, primarily over the parking garages, which further breaks up the massing.
- The front unit will be one-story and 1,241 square feet in size with two bedrooms. The second unit is two stories and 1,884 square feet in size with three bedrooms. The apparent size and scale of the larger, rear unit is minimized by locating it to the rear of the development, and maintaining a one-story unit at the front, facing the street.
- The project features hipped and gable roof forms, appropriately incorporated into the traditional style of the development with a 4:12 roof pitch throughout the development. The overall height of the development will be 23'-6" and two stories, which complies with the height standard and is consistent with the surrounding properties.

Design and Detailing

Are the following items satisfactory and compatible with the project site and surrounding area?

Overall Design and Detailing yes n/a no*If "no" select from below and explain:*

- Design is compatible with neighborhood context
- Design is stylistically consistent
- Employs consistent vocabulary of forms and materials while expressing architectural variety
- Cladding materials and

Entryway yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Well integrated into design
- Avoids sense of monumentality
- Design provides appropriate focal point
- Doors appropriate to design

Windows

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Appropriate to overall design
- Overall window pattern appropriate to style
- Window operation appropriate to style
- Recessed/flush window appropriate to style and/or location
- Openings are well detailed

The new development features nail-in framed windows. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the window section details be revised to show the nail-in framed windows appropriately recessed into the opening with wood sills and frames to be consistent with the traditional style of the project.

Privacy

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Consideration of views from "public" rooms and balconies/roof decks
- Avoid windows facing adjacent windows

Finish Materials and Color

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Textures and colors reinforce design
- High-quality materials, especially facing the street
- Materials appropriately enhance articulation and façade hierarchies
- Wrap corners and terminate appropriately
- Cladding is well detailed, especially at junctions between materials
- Foam trim, finished on site, is prohibited

Paving Materials

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Decorative material at entries/driveways
- Permeable paving when possible
- Material and color related to design

The material of the driveway and walkways is not identified on the plans. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the material be identified and that they be decorative. The applicant may consider the use of permeable paving.

Ancillary Structures

yes n/a no

If "no" select from below and explain:

- Design consistent with primary structure
- Design and materials of gates, fences, and/or walls complement primary structure

Determination of Compatibility: Design and Detailing

The proposed design and detailing are appropriate, as modified by any proposed conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- Overall, the consistent use of materials and colors throughout the project helps to reinforce the traditional design concept.
- The entryways for each unit are well integrated into the design, and avoid a sense of monumentality. Both unit entries are well defined, featuring a porch and recessed doorway with a single-door entry. The new doors will be wood with partial glazing at the top.
- All new windows will be vinyl, clear glass and are an appropriate combination of fixed glass, and casement operations. New wood shutters will accent the windows for the front and rear unit and are appropriately balanced throughout. A condition of approval is recommended requiring a section detail to be submitted that shows the new windows recessed in the wall opening with wood sills, and frames to be consistent with the traditional style.
- The paving material is not identified on the plans. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the material be identified and that they be decorative. The applicant may consider the use of permeable paving.
- The traditional style of the project features an appropriate combination of exterior cladding material including horizontal hardiplank siding, a stone veneer base, stucco, and a composition shingle roof. These finish materials are consistent with the style of the development.

Recommendation / Draft Record of Decision

Based on the above analysis, staff recommends **approval** of the project with **conditions**, as follow:

Conditions

1. That the plans be revised to identify the downspouts and gutters for staff review and approval.
2. That the landscape plan (specifically the plan for the front yard) be redesigned to better complement the traditional style of the development and to comply with the landscaping standards.
3. That an exterior lighting proposal be submitted for staff review and approval for the exterior lighting for the first and second floor with fixtures that are consistent with the proposed traditional style of the development.
4. That details for the fences and gates for staff review and approval. The design and material should be appropriate to the traditional style of the building.
5. That the material for the driveways and walkways be identified on the plans; the material(s) shall be decorative.
6. That the new windows be appropriately recessed into the openings with wood sills and frames. Revised section details shall be submitted for staff review and approval.

Attachments

1. Location Map
2. Neighborhood Survey
3. Photos of Existing Property
4. Reduced Plans
5. Staff Historic Resource Assessment dated September 1, 2016
6. Decision Letter - Administrative Exception Case No. PAE 1614125
7. Indigenous Tree Report
8. Interdepartmental Comments