



## DESIGN REVIEW BOARD RECORD OF DECISION

**Meeting Date** January 24, 2019

**DRB Case No.** PDR 1810309

**Address** 3912 Ramsdell Avenue

**Applicant** Aydin Naghibi

**Project Summary:**

The applicant is proposing to construct a new one-story, 1,124 square-foot single-family residence with a 492 square-foot, attached, two-car garage on an 8,860 square-foot flag lot in the R1 (FAR District II) zone. The existing 494 square-foot single-family residence (originally built in 1906) will be maintained and converted into an accessory dwelling unit (ADU).

**Design Review:**

Board Member	Motion	Second	Yes	No	Absent	Abstain
Arzoumanian	X		X			
Benlian			X			
Malekian					X	
Simonian		X	X			
<b>Totals</b>			<b>3</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	
<b>DRB Decision</b>		Approve with Conditions				

**Conditions:**

1. The applicant shall comply with all of the recommendations identified in the Urban Forestry Department Comments dated January 14, 2019 and obtain an Indigenous Tree Permit.
2. The landscape plan shall be revised to incorporate comments made by Urban Forestry and identify all new and existing landscape materials. All new landscaping shall be drought tolerant.
3. The drawings shall be revised to identify the gutters and downspouts, trash storage area, and mechanical equipment.
4. The amount of paving shall be reduced, specifically between the westerly property line and the buildings.
5. The roof plan shall be revised to show a 6:12 pitch.
6. That any new fence and/or wall located at the rear property line shall not exceed an overall height of 6'-0".

## **Analysis:**

### **Site Planning:**

The proposed site planning is appropriate, as modified by any conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The project's site planning is influenced by the on-site conditions which include the existing oak trees and the fact that the property is a flag lot which limits the buildable area. The building footprint is appropriately sited on the lot in such a way as to address zoning regulations, including setbacks and parking, while minimizing impacts to the oak trees.
- The project site features a total of four indigenous protected trees (Coast Live Oak). One oak tree (#4) is proposed for removal due to its location within the proposed building footprint. An Indigenous Tree Report (Attachment #5) was prepared by the Arborist of Record (AOR) and reviewed by the City's Urban Forestry Department; comments are attached to this report (Attachment #6). Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the applicant comply with the Urban Forestry Department comments dated January 14, 2019, and obtain an Indigenous Tree Permit.
  - The applicant is proposing to install four (4) new 24" box oak trees on-site as mitigation for the one oak tree being removed.
- Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the landscape plan be revised identify new and existing planting materials including the groundcover. All new landscaping shall be drought tolerant.
- There is no consistent neighborhood pattern related to the garage location and the project features an attached garage located and accessed via a new driveway along Ramsdell Avenue. The new attached garage will be accessed via a 90° turn, and the overall design is integrated with the new house, with the garage door perpendicular to the street.
- The proposal does not include any new walls and fences. There is an existing river rock retaining wall located in the public right-of way that spans across the subject property to the southerly neighbor at 3908 Ramsdell Avenue. A portion of this wall will have to be demolished for the required driveway, but the remainder, will be maintained. A board condition of approval will require that any new fences and/or walls proposed at the rear of the property shall not exceed an overall height of 6'-0".

### **Mass and Scale:**

The proposed massing and scale are appropriate, as modified by any conditions, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- The applicant is proposing to build a one-story home in a neighborhood that features both one- and two-story homes. The overall height of the new house will be 18'-9".
- The project's massing is broken up by changes in façade planes and changes in material cladding.
- The proposed hipped roof forms are compatible with the style of development and consistent with the existing house to be converted to an ADU. The use of a 6:12 roof pitch is consistent throughout the design of the new house and with the existing house to be converted to an ADU which also has an 6:12 roof pitch.

### **Design and Detailing:**

The proposed design and detailing are appropriate, as modified by any, to the site and its surroundings for the following reasons:

- Overall, the consistent use of materials and colors throughout the project are appropriate and help reinforce the design.
- The surrounding neighborhood features a mix of architectural styles, primarily traditional and minimal traditional style house. Given this context, the proposed design of the new house is appropriate.
- The entryway is well integrated into the design of the new house and features a covered porch with a recessed single-door entry.

- The new windows will be block frame, brown in color, fiberglass, and a combination of hung, casement and fixed windows. The new windows will be recessed in the opening with a hardie board frame.
- The proposed materials for the new house features cement board siding, smooth stucco, asphalt shingle roofing, and a decorative river rock veneer wainscoting at the base of the new house.
- The new driveway will be a decorative permeable paving material. Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the amount of paving be reduced only for necessary walkways or driveways. Specifically, the concrete and paved areas between the west property line and the two buildings should be minimized and replaced with landscaping.

**The Design Review Board approves the design of projects only. Approval of a project by the Design Review Board does not constitute an approval of compliance with the Zoning Code and/or Building Code requirements.**

If an appeal is not filed within the 15-day appeal period of the Design Review Board decision, plans may be submitted for Building and Safety Division plan check. **Prior** to Building and Safety Division plan check submittal, Design Review Board approved plans must be stamped approved by Design Review Board staff. **Any** changes to the approved plans may constitute returning to the Design Review Board for approval. **Prior** to Building and Safety Division plan check submittal, **all** changes in substantial conformance with approved plans by the Design Review Board must be on file with the Planning Division.

Please make an appointment with the case planner for DRB stamp/sign-off prior to submitting for Building plan check.

DRB Staff Member      Vista Ezzati, Planner

---