Express Memo

City of Glendale Internal Audit

PCI Compliance Audit

2023-07

Report Date: 03/30/2023

Background

The City of Glendale accepts payment cards as a form of payment for fees, therefore City departments must adhere to the Payment Card Industry Data Security Standards (PCI DSS) requirements in order to protect customers' cardholder data. Failure to do so may result in significant fines and/or revocation or suspension of payment card processing privileges, increased liability from potential fraudulent charges, and damage to the City's reputation. To ensure compliance with the PCI DSS, the City hired an external Qualified Security Assessor (QSA) to perform an annual assessment. Additionally, in order to assess ongoing compliance with PCI DSS and help City departments better prepare for the annual assessment, Internal Audit is tasked with performing periodic audits of the City's adherence to its PCI Policy (APM 7-8) and departmental Payment Card Acceptance and Processing Procedures (Procedures). The goal is to cover all inscope sites, systems, and calendar tasks once per year prior to the QSA's annual assessment. This is the first of three audits scheduled for calendar year 2023.

Objective/Scope/Methodology

The objective of this audit is to determine the City's compliance with its PCI Policy and Procedures. The scope of this audit was based upon the PCI DSS in-scope requirements, as defined by the QSA. The detailed scope and methodology are shown in Appendix A.

Summary of Results

As of February 28, 2023, there were a total of 53 in-scope sites/systems/tasks, 21 of which were reviewed during the current audit and 32 that are scheduled to be reviewed in future audits. The table below summarizes the audit schedule for calendar year 2023.

Calendar Year 2023 Audit Schedule

Column1	Current Audit	2nd Audit	3rd Audit	Total
Sites	5	8	6	19
Systems	0	2	3	5
Tasks	16	6	7	29
Total	21	16	16	53

Based on a review of the 21 areas, 1 confirmed exception was noted with respects to PCI training. This issue was subsequently remediated.



Detailed Results

The table below summarizes the controls, number of areas tested, and any exception(s) noted.

Test	Description	Areas Tested	Exception(s)
1.	Determine if departmental Procedures are being followed through performing site visits.	5	1
2.	Determine if system controls (password policy, user accounts, critical patches) are in place to ensure cardholder data is safeguarded. This includes both testing the hosted system and obtaining compliance documentation from third party vendors that utilize the City's merchant ID to process payments cards.	0	0
3.	Determine if the calendar tasks assigned to the PCI Team members are being completed in a timely manner per the City's PCI DSS Guide.	16	0
	Total	21	1

Exceptions and Actions Taken

The table below details the exception(s), action(s) taken, and remediation status.

	Exception(s)	Action(s) Taken
	One site had one new employee who processed payment cards without taking the requisite PCI	The employee has completed PCI training.
	training.	Management has been reminded of the PCI training requirements found within Administrative Policy Manual, Policy 7-8, for all employees who process payment card transactions.
		Status: Remediated

Distribution List

For Action	For Information	
Rafi Manoukian, City Treasurer	Audit Committee	
Guia Murray, Assistant City Treasurer	City Council	
	Suzie Abajian, City Clerk	
	Paula Adams, Chief Human Resources Officer	
	Jason Bradford, Director of Finance & Information Technology	
	Onnig Bulanikian, Director of Community Services & Parks	
	Bradley Calvert, Director of Community Development	
	Manuel Cid, Police Chief	
	Yazdan Emrani, Director of Public Works	
	Tim Ernst, Fire Chief & Deputy City Manager	
	Michael J. Garcia, City Attorney	
	Roubik Golanian, City Manager	
	Gary Shaffer, Director of Library, Arts & Culture	
	John Takhtalian, Assistant City Manager	
	Mark Young, General Manager of Glendale Water & Power	

Appendix A: Detailed Scope and Methodology

The City of Glendale became a Level 2 merchant (1-6 million transactions) in 2018 based on its number of payment card transactions processed in 2017. For calendar year 2022, the City processed over 715,000 credit card transactions and is currently waiting for the card organization's annual assessment of the PCI DSS merchant level that is expected to be received in April 2023.

To ensure compliance with the PCI DSS, the City hired an external QSA to perform an annual assessment and prepare and submit a formal Report on Compliance (ROC) for the City's required validation. A ROC is required for Level 1 merchant and is optional for a Level 2 merchant.

Scope

The scope of this audit covers the PCI DSS requirements, as defined by the QSA and documented within the 2023 PCI Audit Plan shared with the PCI Team at beginning of the calendar year. The in-scope sites, systems, and tasks were based upon the listings maintained by the City Treasurer's Office (CTO).

Methodology

To gain an understanding of the PCI DSS requirements, Internal Audit shadowed the City's QSA during the 2021 annual PCI audit. Internal Audit also consulted with the QSA and/or other PCI Team members as needed throughout the audit. Based upon this understanding, the following procedures were developed:

- Review updated Procedures and interview staff to ensure knowledge and compliance of policies. This may involve the following:
 - Obtaining updated device listings from CTO and ensure devices being used are reflected in the device listings.
 - Verifying that employees who handle payment card information have taken the necessary PCI training.
- Perform system assessments to ensure third parties have safeguards in place to protect cardholder data. This may involve the following:
 - Collecting Attestation of Compliance documents.
 - Reviewing PCI compliance language in City contracts.
 - Performing system reviews.
- Review the City's PCI Policy (APM 7-8) and PCI DSS Guide to ensure knowledge and compliance of policies. This may involve the following:
 - Reviewing tasks noted in the Annual PCI Compliance Calendar and ensure they are being timely performed by assigned parties.
 - Interviewing PCI Team members to determine their knowledge and compliance with established roles.

Frequency

Internal Audit plans to test all in-scope sites, systems, and calendar tasks once per year through three separate quarterly audits. The next audit is scheduled to take place in June 2023.